

May 13, 1996
No. 101

FOREIGN AID WINS FEW FRIENDS AT THE UNITED NATIONS

By Bryan T. Johnson
Policy Analyst

Last year, Congress tried to cut the U.S. foreign aid budget as part of its plan to reduce wasteful government spending and balance the federal budget deficit. Moreover, both houses of Congress passed legislation that would have abolished the Agency for International Development, the U.S. agency responsible for most of America's \$13 billion foreign aid program, along with most of its functions. Because the Clinton Administration fought these proposals, Congress was unable to make more significant cuts in foreign aid or eliminate these wasteful government functions.

The Clinton Administration says foreign aid supports America's interests overseas. It claims, for example, that U.S. aid helps America gain influence with countries around the world and that these countries generally support America's foreign policy goals. A quick look at the facts, however, shows that these arguments are groundless.

One measurement of America's influence around the world is the voting records of U.S. foreign aid recipients in the United Nations. If a direct connection exists between foreign aid and winning friends overseas, as the Administration asserts, recipients should be voting with the U.S. in the U.N. most of the

Table 1

Top Ten Countries Voting Against the U.S. at the U.N. and U.S. Foreign Aid for FY 1996

	FY '96 U.S. Aid	Votes Against U.S. in U.N., 1995
1. India	\$156,650,000	83 %
2. China, People's Rep. of	604,000	79
3. Seychelles	40,000	75
4. Lebanon	8,475,000	74
5. Laos	2,000,000	73
6. Pakistan	2,500,000	72
7. Nigeria	26,827,000	69
8. Sierra Leone	869,000	69
9. Djibouti	250,000	68
10. Burkina Faso	13,386,000	67
Total	\$211,801,000	

time. In fact, they do not. The data show that most recipients of foreign aid vote against the U.S. most of the time. Consider the following fact gathered from the 1995 U.N. session:

X 64 percent of U.S. foreign aid recipients voted against the U.S. a majority of the time.

X India, the fifth-largest recipient with some \$157 million in U.S. foreign aid this year, voted against the U.S. 83 percent of the time. That is as often as Cuba and more often than Iran.

X The ten countries that voted against the U.S. the most frequently will receive over \$212 million in foreign aid in FY 1996 (see Table 1).

X Seven of the ten largest recipients of U.S. foreign aid voted against the U.S. a majority of the time (see Table 2).

X Of the ten countries that voted with the U.S. the most often, nine are former Soviet bloc countries (see Table 3).

X Egypt, the second largest recipient of American foreign aid, voted against the U.S. 67 percent of the time. This is worse than the 1994 session, when Egypt voted against the U.S. 65 percent of the time. Egypt will receive some \$2.2 billion in U.S. foreign aid in FY 1996.

X Haiti, where President Bill Clinton sent American troops to restore deposed President Jean-Bertrand Aristide, voted against the U.S. 60 percent of the time during the 1996 session. Despite this, the U.S. will send some \$124 million in foreign aid to Haiti in FY 1996.

Table 2

Top Ten Foreign Aid Recipients for FY 1996 And Their Votes Against the U.S. in the U.N.

	FY '96 U.S. Aid	Votes Against U.S. in U.N., 1995
1. Israel	\$3,000,000,000	3%
2. Egypt	2,116,000,000	67
3. Russia	264,241,000	27
4. Ukraine	162,389,000	40
5. India	156,650,000	83
6. South Africa	132,378,000	53
7. Peru	124,377,000	53
8. Haiti	123,385,000	60
9. Bolivia	121,489,000	54
10. Ethiopia	109,125,000	54
Total	\$6,310,034,000	

Table 3

Top Ten Countries Voting With the U.S. at the U.N. and Total Foreign Aid for FY 1996

	FY '96 U.S. Aid	Votes Against U.S. in U.N., 1995
1. Israel	\$3,000,000,000	3%
2. Tajikistan	7,000,000	9
3. Latvia	7,835,000	13
4. Georgia	21,250,000	14
5. Uzbekistan	12,424,000	14
6. Hungary	30,242,000	17
7. Estonia	385,000	18
8. Lithuania	13,074,000	19
9. Slovenia	4,595,000	21
10. TFYR Macedonia	16,974,000	22
Total	\$3,113,779,000	

X **Mexico**, where President Bill Clinton fought for a \$40 billion international economic bailout, most of which will come from U.S. taxpayers, voted against the U.S. 58 percent of the time. In addition to its \$40 billion economic bailout plan, the Clinton Administration has endorsed another \$25 million in foreign aid for Mexico.

There may be many reasons why a country votes with or against the U.S. at the U.N. But it is clear from these data that foreign aid does not win friends where it counts: in supporting U.S. diplomatic initiatives at the United Nations. Clearly, the U.S. foreign aid program in general, and under the Clinton Administration in particular, has done little to justify public confidence that tax dollars are being used wisely by America's foreign aid bureaucracy. President Clinton has defended two of his biggest foreign policy and economic initiatives—"restoring" democracy in Haiti and the economic bailout of Mexico—as in the U.S. national interest. Yet these countries seem to care little about America's interests when it comes to supporting the U.S. at the U.N.

Congress should evaluate the extent to which U.S. recipients of foreign aid support America's national interests. U.N. voting records clearly show that a majority of recipients of U.S. foreign aid vote against the U.S. most of the time. In fact, the data show that some of these countries actually undermine U.S. interests abroad. For example, South Africa, America's sixth largest recipient of foreign aid is quickly extending relations to some of America's biggest enemies: Cuba, Iran, and Libya. This fiscal year, South Africa will receive some \$132 million in U.S. foreign aid.

Why, then, is the U.S. spending so much money on countries that obviously care little about America's interests abroad? And why is the Clinton Administration fighting to save this program when most Americans are opposed to it? This year, when the U.S. foreign aid budget is scrutinized by Congress as a target for reaching a balanced budget, Congress would do well to cut the program further and seek to abolish the Agency for International Development.

Table 4

Votes Against U.S.-Supported Issues in the United Nations by Recipients of U.S. Foreign Aid

	FY '96 U.S. Aid	Votes Against U.S. in U.N., 1995	FY '96 U.S. Aid	Votes Against U.S. in U.N., 1995	FY '96 U.S. Aid	Votes Against U.S. in U.N., 1995	
1. India	\$156,650,000	63%	\$5,599,000	60%	\$9,000,000	48%	
2. China, People's Rep. of	604,000	79	51,096,000	60	800,000	48	
3. Seychelles	240,000	75	810,000	60	12,527,000	48	
4. Lebanon	8,475,000	74	2,343,000	59	5,451,000	47	
5. Laos	2,000,000	73	18,127,000	59	18,434,000	44	
6. Pakistan	2,500,000	72	27,996,000	59	1,364,000	44	
7. Nigeria	26,827,000	69	31,238,000	59	15,149,000	41	
8. Sierra Leone	869,000	68	55,520,000	59	64,464,000	40	
9. Djibouti	250,000	68	25,242,000	58	162,389,000	40	
10. Burkina Faso	13,386,000	67	120,000	57	19,275,000	39	
11. Egypt	2,116,000,000	67	800,000	57	31,387,000	38	
12. Gambia	5,472,000	67	76,259,000	56	56,938,000	67	
13. Indonesia	63,854,000	67	2,356,000	55	883,000	35	
14. Togo	2,537,000	66	35,807,000	55	80,840,000	33	
15. Yemen	9,465,000	66	39,879,000	55	1,813,000	33	
16. Cape Verde	3,914,000	65	121,489,000	54	32,950,000	31	
17. Oman	110,000	65	4,204,000	54	300,000	31	
18. Angola	10,000,000	64	109,125,000	54	29,600,000	30	
19. Burundi	4,938,000	64	47,149,000	54	106,800,000	29	
20. Guinea-Bissau	7,649,000	64	37,902,000	54	800,000	28	
21. Mali	31,594,000	64	2,888,000	54	43,783,000	27	
22. Niger	20,062,000	64	29,932,000	54	31,339,000	27	
23. Sri Lanka	2,712,000	64	2,018,000	54	284,241,000	27	
24. Tunisia	25,461,000	63	1,752,000	53	13,410,000	25	
25. Zimbabwe	100,000	62	22,886,000	53	48,137,000	2	
26. Bahrain	20,856,000	62	12,816,000	53	34,260,000	24	
27. Benin	2,204,000	62	39,307,000	53	5,457,000	24	
28. Chad	2,155,000	62	7,655,000	53	9,819,000	23	
29. Mauritania	37,732,000	62	2,211,000	53	69,980,000	23	
30. Malawi	32,442,000	62	124,377,000	53	16,974,000	22	
31. Senegal	2,385,000	61	32,378,000	53	4,595,000	21	
32. Cameroon	38,708,000	61	42,820,000	52	13,074,000	19	
33. Colombia	3,103,000	61	43,077,000	52	385,000	18	
34. Gabon	46,258,000	61	11,975,000	52	30,242,000	17	
35. Jordan	600,000	61	6,252,000	51	21,250,000	14	
36. Malaysia	78,050,000	60	19,575,000	50	12,424,000	14	
37. Bangladesh	2,212,000	60	1,594,000	49	7,835,000	13	
38. Cote d'Ivoire	123,385,000	60	1,800,000	49	7,000,000	9	
39. Haiti	41,698,000	60	1,733,000	49	3,000,000,000	3	
40. Kenya							
41. Thailand							
42. Uganda							
43. Vanuatu							
44. Congo							
45. Brazil							
46. Guinea							
47. Morocco							
48. Mozambique							
49. Mexico							
50. Mauritius							
51. Venezuela							
52. Philippines							
53. Chile							
54. Madagascar							
55. Zambia							
56. Bolivia							
57. Botswana							
58. Ethiopia							
59. Guatemala							
60. Honduras							
61. Lesotho							
62. Nepal							
63. Uruguay							
64. Costa Rica							
65. Ecuador							
66. Namibia							
67. Nicaragua							
68. Panama							
69. Papua New Guinea							
70. Peru							
71. South Africa							
72. Cambodia							
73. El Salvador							
74. Mongolia							
75. Guyana							
76. Jamaica							
77. Belize							
78. Fiji							
79. Swaziland							
80. Azerbaijan							
81. Bahamas							
82. Paraguay							
83. Rwanda							
84. Kyrgyzstan							
85. Solomon Islands							
86. Eritrea							
87. Kazakhstan							
88. Ukraine							
89. Belarus							
90. Armenia							
91. Ghana							
92. Marshall Islands							
93. Bosnia/Herzegovina							
94. Micronesia							
95. Albania							
96. Argentina							
97. Ireland							
98. Turkey							
99. Portugal							
100. Bulgaria							
101. Moldova							
102. Russia							
103. Croatia							
104. Romania							
105. Slovak Republic							
106. Turkmenistan							
107. Czech Republic							
108. Poland							
109. TFR Macedonia							
110. Slovenia							
111. Lithuania							
112. Estonia							
113. Hungary							
114. Georgia							
115. Uzbekistan							
116. Latvia							
117. Tajikistan							
118. Israel							

Notes: Countries ranked by votes against U.S. in the U.N. List includes only countries which received more than \$100,000. Sources: Total foreign assistance from the Agency for International Development, Congressional Presentation; Summary Tables, Fiscal Year 1996. This number includes only bilateral assistance and omits foreign aid given through indirect sources. The World Bank and the International Monetary Fund, and U.S. "regional" aid. U.N. votes from Voting Practices in the United Nations 1995, U.S. Department of State, March 31, 1996. Figures are based only on votes where a recorded or "no" occurred. They omit abstentions and other "non-votes." The percentage "voting against" number in this table are based on percentage votes in favor of all resolutions voted on by the U.S. in each given year.

Table 5

Recipients of U.S. Foreign Aid and Their Votes Against U.S.-Supported Issues in the United Nations

	Votes Against U.S. in U.N., 1995		FY '96 U.S. Aid		Votes Against U.S. in U.N., 1995		FY '96 U.S. Aid		Votes Against U.S. in U.N., 1995	
		%				%				%
1. Israel	\$3,000,000,000	3%	41.	Morocco	\$31,238,000	59%	80.	Rwanda	\$451,000	47%
2. Egypt	2,116,000,000	67	42.	Hungary	30,242,000	17	81.	Burundi	4,938,000	64
3. Russia	264,241,000	27	43.	Nepal	29,935,000	54	82.	Slovenia	4,595,000	21
4. Ukraine	162,389,000	40	44.	Ireland	29,600,000	30	83.	Botswana	4,204,000	54
5. India	156,650,000	83	45.	Guinea	27,996,000	59	84.	Cape Verde	3,914,000	65
6. South Africa	132,378,000	53	46.	Nigeria	26,827,000	69	85.	Gabon	3,103,000	61
7. Peru	124,377,000	53	47.	Zimbabwe	25,461,000	63	86.	Lesotho	2,888,000	54
8. Haiti	123,385,000	60	48.	Mexico	25,242,000	58	87.	Tunisia	2,712,000	54
9. Bolivia	121,489,000	54	49.	Ecuador	22,886,000	53	88.	Togo	2,537,000	66
10. Ethiopia	109,125,000	54	50.	Georgia	21,250,000	14	89.	Pakistan	2,500,000	72
11. Turkey	106,800,000	29	51.	Benin	20,866,000	62	90.	Cameroon	2,385,000	61
12. Bosnia/Herzegovina	80,840,000	33	52.	Sri Lanka	20,062,000	64	91.	Chile	2,358,000	55
13. Bangladesh	78,050,000	60	53.	Jamaica	19,575,000	50	92.	Congo	2,343,000	58
14. Philippines	76,259,000	56	54.	Belarus	19,275,000	39	93.	Cote d'Ivoire	2,212,000	60
15. Poland	69,680,000	23	55.	Kyrgyzstan	18,430,000	44	94.	Chad	2,204,000	62
16. Kazakhstan	64,464,000	40	56.	Brazil	18,127,000	59	95.	Mauritania	2,155,000	62
17. Indonesia	63,854,000	67	57.	TFYR Macedonia	16,974,000	22	96.	Papua New Guinea	2,121,000	58
18. Ghana	56,938,000	37	58.	Eritrea	15,149,000	41	97.	Uruguay	2,018,000	54
19. Mozambique	55,520,000	59	59.	Croatia	13,386,000	67	98.	Laos	2,000,000	73
20. Uganda	51,096,000	60	60.	Burkina Faso	13,386,000	67	99.	Micronesia	1,813,000	33
21. Romania	48,137,000	25	61.	Lithuania	13,074,000	19	100.	Fiji	1,800,000	49
22. Guatemala	47,149,000	54	62.	Namibia	12,816,000	53	101.	Costa Rica	1,752,000	52
23. Jordan	46,258,000	61	63.	Paraguay	12,527,000	48	102.	Swaziland	1,733,000	49
24. Bulgaria	43,783,000	27	64.	Uzbekistan	12,424,000	14	103.	Belize	1,594,000	49
25. El Salvador	43,077,000	52	65.	Mongolia	11,975,000	52	104.	Solomon Islands	1,364,000	44
26. Cambodia	42,820,000	52	66.	Angola	10,000,000	64	105.	Marshall Islands	883,000	35
27. Kenya	41,698,000	60	67.	Czech Republic	9,819,000	23	106.	Sierra Leone	869,000	69
28. Zambia	39,879,000	55	68.	Yemen	9,465,000	66	107.	Vanuatu	810,000	60
29. Mali	39,804,000	54	69.	Azerbaijan	9,000,000	48	108.	Venezuela	800,000	57
30. Nicaragua	39,307,000	53	70.	Lebanon	8,475,000	74	109.	Bahamas	800,000	48
31. Colombia	38,708,000	61	71.	Latvia	7,835,000	13	110.	Portugal	800,000	28
32. Honduras	37,902,000	54	72.	Panama	7,655,000	53	111.	China, People's Rep. of	604,000	78
33. Malawi	37,732,000	61	73.	Guinea-Bissau	7,649,000	64	112.	Estonia	385,000	18
34. Madagascar	35,807,000	54	74.	Tajikistan	7,000,000	9	113.	Argentina	300,000	31
35. Slovak Republic	34,260,000	24	75.	Guyana	6,252,000	51	114.	Djibouti	250,000	68
36. Albania	32,950,000	30	76.	Malaysia	6,000,000	61	115.	Seychelles	240,000	75
37. Senegal	32,442,000	62	77.	Thailand	5,599,000	60	116.	Mauritius	120,000	57
38. Niger	31,594,000	64	78.	Gambia	5,472,000	67	117.	Oman	110,000	65
39. Armenia	31,382,000	38	79.	Turkmenistan	5,457,000	23	118.	Bahrain	100,000	62
40. Moldova	31,339,000	26								

Notes: Countries ranked by amount of U.S. aid. List includes only countries which received more than \$100,000.

Sources: Total foreign assistance from the Agency for International Development, Congressional Presentation; Summary Tables, Fiscal Year 1996. This number includes only bilateral assistance and omits foreign aid given through indirect sources, like the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund, and U.S. "regional" aid. U.N. votes from Voting Practices in the United Nations 1995, U.S. Department of State, March 31, 1996. Figures are based only on votes where a recorded "yes" or "no" occurred. They omit abstentions and other "non-votes." The percentage "voting against" numbers in this table are based on percentage votes in favor of all resolutions voted on by the U.S. in each given year.

